

## Technical Evaluation Report

Detailed Design of Infrastructure Sub-Projects, Sectoral Planning & Resident Supervision in 16 Cities of Punjab (5-Packages)

Name of country Name of Project	Islamic Republic of Pakistan Punjab Cities Program (PCP)-6263-PK
Client: (a) name (b) address, phone, facsimile	Punjab Municipal Development Fund Company (PMDFC) H#184, Upper Mall, Scotch Corner, Lahore Tel: 042-99204386-89 Facsimile: 042-99204390
Type of assignment (pre-investment, preparation, or implementation), and brief description of sources	Detailed Design of Infrastructure Sub-Projects, Sectoral Planning & Resident Supervision in 16 Cities of Punjab (5-Packages)
Method of selection:	Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS)
Request for expressions of interest: (a) publication in <i>United Nations Development Business</i> (UNDB) (b) publication in national newspaper(s) (c) number of responses	Yes  “The News” and “Nawa-e-Waqt” dated April 22, 2021.  <b>Package-1:</b> 13 Firms <b>Package-2:</b> 11 Firms <b>Package-3:</b> 12 Firms <b>Package-4:</b> 11 Firms <b>Package-5:</b> 12 Firms
Shortlist: (a) names/nationality of firms/associations (mark domestic firms and firms that had expressed interest)	<u>Shortlisted Firm:</u>  <b>Package-1:</b> 8 Firms <b>Package-2:</b> 8 Firms <b>Package-3:</b> 8 Firms <b>Package-4:</b> 8 Firms <b>Package-5:</b> 8 Firms
Request for Proposals: (a) issuance to consultants	Date: 1 <sup>st</sup> September, 2021
Pre-proposal conference: (a) minutes issued	Yes. September 14, 2021 Yes

Proposal submission: (a) two envelopes (technical and financial proposals)	Date:30 <sup>th</sup> September,2021      Time 03:30 pm hours
Submission of Proposals (Technical & Financial)	Location: Reception Counter, House No. 184, Scotch Corner, Upper Mall, Lahore
Opening of Technical Proposals	Date:30 <sup>th</sup> September,2021      Time 04:00 pm
Number of proposals submitted	Package 1 - Five (05) Package 2 - Three (03) Package 3 - Five (05) Package 4 - Four (04) Package 5 - Four (04)

#### Detail of Technically Qualified Firms;

##### Package-1

Sr #	Description	Score as per RFP	Scores Awarded to the Firm				
			<a href="#">MM Pakistan Pvt Ltd.</a>	<a href="#">Jers Consultancy (Pvt)Ltd JV with National Development Consultants Pvt Ltd</a>	<a href="#">National Engineering Services Pakistan Pvt Ltd</a>	<a href="#">Koltek Musavirlik A.S. (Turkey) JV with Umar Munshi Associates (Pakistan) with JV Bogazici Proje Muhendislik A.S. (Turkey) with JV in Osmani &amp; Company Pvt Ltd (Pakistan)</a>	<a href="#">Alter Uluslararası Mühendislik Ve Musavirlik Hizmeleri Ltd Sti (Turkey) JV with Suis Proje Muhendislik Ve Msavirlik Ltd Sti (Turkey)</a>
1	<b>Specific Experience</b>	<b>10</b>	10.00	10.00	10.00	10.00	10.00
2	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>20</b>	17.50	15.50	17.00	19.25	18.38
3	<b>Workplan</b>	<b>20</b>	15.50	10.00	12.75	14.00	16.63
4	<b>Key Experts</b>	<b>50</b>	49.30	46.60	44.80	49.00	46.00
5	<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	92.30	82.10	84.55	92.25	91.00

## Package-2

Sr #	Description	Score as per RFP	Scores Awarded to the Firm		
			<a href="#">Enviro Consultant (SMC-PVT) Ltd JV with BARQAAB Consulting Services (Pvt) Limited</a>	<a href="#">National Engineering Services Pakistan Pvt Ltd JV with MM Pakistan Ltd and Associated Consulting Engineers ACE Limited</a>	<a href="#">Koltek Musavirlik A.S. (Turkey) JV with Umar Munshi Associates (Pakistan) with JV Bogazici Proje Muhendislik A.S. (Turkey) with JV in Osmani &amp; Company Pvt Ltd (Pakistan)</a>
1	<b>Specific Experience</b>	<b>10</b>	10.00	10.00	10.00
2	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>20</b>	8.25	17.00	19.25
3	<b>Workplan</b>	<b>20</b>	8.13	12.75	14.00
4	<b>Key Experts</b>	<b>50</b>	45.80	45.60	43.70
5	<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	72.18	85.35	86.95

## Package-3

Sr #	Description	Score as per RFP	Scores Awarded to the Firm				
			<a href="#">MM Pakistan Pvt Ltd. Limited</a>	<a href="#">Jers Consultancy (Pvt)Ltd JV with National Development Consultants Pvt Ltd</a>	<a href="#">National Engineering Services Pakistan Pvt Ltd</a>	<a href="#">Alter Uluslararası Mühendislik Ve Mısamırlık Hizmetleri Ltd Sti (Turkey) JV with Suis Proje Mühendislik Ve Mısamırlık Ltd Sti (Turkey) and Osmani Company Pvt Ltd Pakistan</a>	<a href="#">National Engineering Corporation-Pakistan JV with Sunjin Engineering and Architecture Co. Ltd (Korea)</a>
1	<b>Specific Experience</b>	<b>10</b>	10.00	10.00	10.00	10.00	10.00
2	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>20</b>	17.50	15.50	17.00	18.38	14.50
3	<b>Workplan</b>	<b>20</b>	15.50	10.00	12.75	16.63	10.50
4	<b>Key Experts</b>	<b>50</b>	47.20	48.20	50.00	47.20	39.00
5	<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	90.20	83.70	89.75	92.20	74.00

#### Package-4

Sr #	Description	Score as per RFP	<a href="#">National Engineering Services Pakistan Pvt Ltd JV with MM Pakistan Ltd and Associated Consulting Engineers ACE Limited</a>	<a href="#">Alter Uluslararası Mühendislik Ve Muhendislik Hizmetleri Ltd Sti (Turkey) JV with Suis Proje Mühendislik Ve Msavirlik Ltd Sti (Turkey) and Osmani Company Pvt Ltd Pakistan</a>	<a href="#">Associates in Development Pvt Ltd</a>	<a href="#">Asian Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd, and M/s Rehman Habib Consulting Firm</a>
1	<b>Specific Experience</b>	<b>10</b>	10.00	10.00	8.00	10.00
2	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>20</b>	17.00	18.38	15.00	10.00
3	<b>Workplan</b>	<b>20</b>	12.75	16.63	10.75	9.88
4	<b>Key Experts</b>	<b>50</b>	43.30	45.30	40.20	50.00
5	<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	83.05	90.30	73.95	79.88

#### Package-5

Sr #	Description	Score as per RFP	Scores Awarded to the Firm			
			<a href="#">MM Pakistan Pvt Ltd JV with M/s Associates in Development</a>	<a href="#">Enviro Consultant (SMC-PVT) Ltd JV with BARQAAB Consulting Services (Pvt) Limited</a>	<a href="#">Jers Consultancy (Pvt) Ltd JV with National Development Consultants Pvt Ltd</a>	<a href="#">National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd JV with Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd</a>
1	<b>Specific Experience</b>	<b>10</b>	10.00	10.00	10.00	10.00
2	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>20</b>	17.50	11.75	15.50	17.00
3	<b>Workplan</b>	<b>20</b>	15.50	10.38	10.00	12.75
4	<b>Key Experts</b>	<b>50</b>	47.20	44.20	46.50	44.60
5	<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	90.20	76.33	82.00	84.35

**Note:** All the technically responsive firms have been intimated about the status/results.