

Local Government & Community Development Department



Punjab Cities Program

Gap Analysis

of

Municipal Services infrastructure & service delivery

in

Kamalia City



Punjab Municipal Development Fund Company

Section-1 City Background

1. Tehsil Status

Kamalia was raised to the status of tehsil and affiliated with the newly established district Toba Taik Singh on 01.07.1982. After the introduction of PLGO-2001, the Tehsil Municipal Administration Kamalia was formulated on 12.08.2001.

The area was inhabited by migrants from central Punjab after construction of irrigation system and Kamalia became the commercial center having grain markets and other commercial activities.

1.1. Location

Kamalia Town is located at 72°-39' East longitude and 30°-43' North latitude. The town is located at a distance of 105 km from Faisalabad, 240 km from Lahore, and 32 km from Toba Taik Singh. The newly constructed motorway is passing at a distance of 15 Km at the north west of this town and the access to Lahore and other main cities has been eased out.

1.2. The Climate

The climate of the city is very hot in summer. The annual average rain fall over here has been measured to 372 millimeters. During summer, the temperature rises to 45 degree centigrade with minimum 20 degree centigrade whereas during winter the temperature falls to maximum 21 degree centigrade and minimum 7 degree centigrade.

1.3. Demographic status

The population census report of year 2017 has not been published by Government of Pakistan. However the provisional data available from 2017 census contains a population of 135641 persons within the municipal boundary of this town. As per land scan process the town has annual growth rate of 3.29 % and the population of the town is expected to rise to 187,488 persons in the year 2027.

1.4. Data collection

The formats for the data collection about the municipal services were designed by PMDFC and sent to the Municipal Committee. After receipt of these formats from MC, the municipal committee was visited to;

- 1) Verify and correct the data provided by the municipal committee.
- 2) Update the descriptive maps of all the services by consultation with MC staff.
- 3) Identify the required improvements and extension of the municipal services infrastructure.
- 4) Identification of Public Private Partnership projects already executed
- 5) Identify the capacity of the key officers to undertake the PPP projects and collaborative projects with other government agencies and MCs
- 6) Public opinion surveys regarding the delivery of municipal services.

1.5. Situation analysis and Gap analysis

Situation analysis of the existing municipal services infrastructure and the quality of service delivery was done. Gap analysis was done to identify the problems, bottlenecks and shortcomings in the infrastructure itself and its operation & maintenance for each municipal service along with the correction/updating of descriptive maps.

Section-2 Water supply system

2.1. Water sources

The city is considered as a single unit or zone with respect to water supply. Deep ground water is fresh and hence the water supply system is based on deep tubewells installed at various locations in the city. The Town is served by direct pumping in some areas whereas in some areas water is supplied to the consumers through overhead reservoirs.

Five tubewells of 1.0 cusec capacity each were previously working in the Town whereas 8 additional tubewells of 2.0 cusecs capacity each have been installed by PHE Department and commissioned. So in all 13 tubewells are presently working in the Town. The newly installed tubewells are being operated by MC as told by MC staff but these have formally not been taken over by

The details of these tubewells are given below;

Sector	No. of tube wells	Capacity each (cusecs)	Total capacity (cusecs)	Working hours per day	Daily water production (mgd)	
					Present with 8 hours pumping	Possible with 14 hours pumping
Already installed	4	1.00	4.0	8	0.72	1.26
	1	0.5	0.5	8	0.09	0.157
Recently installed by PHED	8	2.00	16	8	2.88	5.04
Grand total	13	-	17	-	3.39	6.457
Present population of the city					108,129	Persons
Present production per capita per day					31	gallons
Possible water production per capita per day					60	Gallons

The source capacity is quite sufficient now to even meet the peak hour demand of the Town. However water wastage should be controlled by consumer metering to make the system more efficient and reduce the O&M charges. No further addition of source capacity is required.

2.1.1. Scope of the recently completed project

Scope of the scheme recently completed by PHED is described below;

Name of project		Comprehensive water supply scheme Kamalia Town		
Designed population (Year 2029)		227,030 Persons		
A.A. cost		PKR 426.211 million		
Technical Sanction cost		PKR 441.249 million		
Physical progress (as provided by PHE Department on 10.07.2019)				
SN	item of work	Scope of work	Works completed	Remarks
1	Trial bores	8-Jobs	8-Jobs	
2	Tube-wells (2.00-cusec)	8-No.	8-No.	

3	Pump house (12' x 12')	8-No.	8-No.		
4	Rising main / distribution system	All lengths in RFt.			
	a)	16" i/d AC "B" Class	700	220	Work in Progress
	b)	14" i/d PVC "B" Class	351	370	
	c)	12" i/d PVC "B" Class	3,010	3,568	
	d)	10" i/d PVC "B" Class	9,395	8,598	
	e)	8" i/d PVC "B" Class	47,834	50,634	
	f)	6" i/d PVC "B" Class	115,776	123,424	
	g)	4" i/d PVC "B" Class	47,515	57,557	
	h)	3" i/d PVC "B" Class	523,064	354,020	
5	Pumping machinery	8-Set	8-Set		
6	Overhead reservoir (5-lac glns)	2-No.	1 No=90% completed	Site not handed over for one No OHR	
7	Hypo chlorinator	8-No.	7-No.		
8	Suigas, PTCL-line & road crossings	3-Job	-		
9	Boundary wall	Job	Job		
10	Staff quarter	1-No.	1-No.		
11	Power connections	8-Job	8-Job		

2.3 Storage Capacity:

The overhead storage capacity in the Town is given below;

S.N.	Water works	No. of OHRs	Capacity (gallons)	Repairs required
1	Near MC office	1	50,000	Minor repair
1	Mohalla Muslim Sheikhan	1	500,000	Minor repair
	Total	2	550,000	

2.4 Problems and gaps in the system

2.4.1 Water shortage

No water shortage is being experienced in the Town.

2.4.2 Un Served Areas

Entire Town is served with the water supply system now.

2.4.3 Areas with abandoned water supply system

No area in the city comprises of abandoned water supply system.

2.5 Water supply hours and consumer connections

Water Supply hours				Consumer connections			
Morning	Midday	Evening	Total	Domestic	Commercial	Industrial	Total

4	2	2	8	3780	20	Nil	3800
---	---	---	---	------	----	-----	------

2.6 Total coverage of the city

After completion of the recent project almost 98 of the Town population has been served with the facility.

2.7 Tariff structure

The consumer connections are not metered and hence water wastage should be predominant over here. The tariff comprises of flat rates not even levied according to the area of houses even. The water rates are given below;

Tariff Rates per month		
Domestic	Commercial	Industrial
Rs. 100	Rs. 700	Nil

2.8 Required rehabilitation of water supply system

Under mentioned components of the existing water supply system need rehabilitation.

2.8.1 Repair & Replacements of tube wells and pumping machinery

Type of Pump	Discharge each (cusec)	Replacement of tube wells	Replacement of pumping units	Repairs of pumping machinery
Turbine Pumps	1.0	-	-	5*

*These pumping units were installed in the year 2007. The units now require repairs which will include all electrical and mechanical items and PCC pump foundations along with painting of all the units and accessories.

2.8.2 Repair of Pump Houses:

Water works	Total No's	Size (Ft.)	Repairs Required	Replacement Required
Tube wells	5	12'x12'	4 Nos	01 No

2.8.3 Distribution system:

98% of the city area is equipped with the distribution system after completion of the project by PHE Department.

2.8.4 Water wastage & Water management

Lot of water wastage is occurring in the water supply system in below given ways;

- Some consumer connections have no taps.
- Some consumers keep the taps open in all water supply hours although they do not need water.

- c) Most of the overhead tanks of the consumers have no float valve and when their tank is full, the water flows down to the drains continuously during the supply hours.

The water wastage requires excessive water production and high electricity consumption. It is exerting a large pressure on the municipal budget. Large savings in the electricity bills and ultimately the O&M cost, can be affected by reducing the water wastage at the consumer ends. It will save lot of water and water shortage can be addressed by conservation of water being wasted at present. The best and efficient way to save water and reduce O&M cost is the **consumer metering**.

Installation of consumer meters on 3800 Nos consumer connections is required.

2.8.5 Repairs & replacement of other components

These components include;

- Hypo-chlorinators = Nil
- Replacement of sub-standard consumer connections with underground piping & saddles = 1400 (Actual numbers will be determined after survey and investigation of all consumer connections)

2.9 O&M Charges and revenue recovery

The operation & maintenance charges and the revenue recovered during the last four years is given below;

Year	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	Total for five years
O&M charges (million PKR)	27.94	30.24	28.93	30.13	46.05	163.29
Revenue recovery (million PKR)	4.25	7.20	7.87	7.95	10.00	37.27
Recovery % as compared with O&M exp.	15%	24%	27%	26%	22%	23%
Subsidy injected (million PKR)	23.69	23.04	21.06	22.18	36.05	126.02

The above mentioned data shows a very weak billing and recovery system of the water revenue which is required to be improved by capacity building of the recovery staff.

2.10 Manpower deployment

Slot	Sanctioned strength	Existing strength	Vacant post	Manpower on daily wages	Total manpower deployed
Tubewell operators	21	3	17	-	4
Chowkidars	-	-	-	2	2
Electricians	-	-	-	-	-
Plumbers	-	-	-	5	5
Clerks	-	-	-	4	4
Total	21	3	17	11	15

2.11 Service delivery

1. Water supply is operated for total 8 hours per day. The quantity of water being produced presently (31gpcd) is quite enough for the served areas. However the supply hours can be increased with increase in population and for meeting the demand on peak hours.
2. After completion of the scheme by PHED, almost entire population of the Town is covered.
3. None of the consumer connection is metered and it is proposed to meter all the consumer connections to reduce the water wastage to conserve fresh water and to save the electricity cost being incurred on production of water and pumping the waste water from sewerage systems.

Section-3 Sewerage system

3.1. Existing situation

3.1.1. Coverage

The city is equipped with sewerage system in 80% area and divided in to three drainage Zones. The short description of each zone has been given as under;

3.1.2. Zone-A:

Area of zone-A is 1151 acre. This zone is equipped with sewers in main roads and streets but most of the streets have not been provided with lateral sewers. The entire area is drained by Chungi No-6 disposal works which is fed with two trunk sewers of 36" & 42" dia sewers both of which have been partially choked and hence the catchment areas are flooded. The disposal works needed repairs which is under process under the on-going project of PHED. A new outfall 24" dia sewer has been proposed by PHED for serving some areas in the north west of the city which will discharge in this disposal works. Waste water from this pumping station was previously being disposed of in the lands across railway track located at north-west of this disposal works. PHED has proposed to lay a force main of 28" dia AC pipe to take the water to a stabilization sump to be constructed near an irrigation distributory in the south of the Town and ultimately dispose it in the lands across the distributory for broad irrigation through a sullage carrier. This force main has not been laid as yet.

3.1.3. Zone-B:

The Area of zone-B is 275 acre and fully served by the facility. The Zeeshan Colony disposal station is serving this area and pumping waste water across the railway track through a sullage carrier in agricultural lands where it is used for broad irrigation.

3.1.4. Recent interventions by PHE Department

PHE Department has recently executed the improvement & extension of the sewerage system in this town in two phases. Phase-I of the project has been completed whereas Phase-II of the Project is under execution. The scope of work of these phases is given below. The scope of work completed in Zone-C is described as under;

3.1.5. Zone-C:

Area of Drainage Zone-C is 824 acres and areas in this drainage zone have been drained off by two outfall sewers of 36" dia combining into one outfall sewer of 42" dia along with few branch sewers and lateral sewers which are discharging water in the disposal station recently constructed by PHE Department near bypass road. The system has been commissioned and waste water is being pumped through a force main of 24" dia AC pipe into a stabilization sump from where it is proposed be taken to the Kamalia Forest for its broad irrigation through a sullage carrier included in Phase-II of the Project. This sullage carrier has not been constructed as yet and water is being discharged into an irrigation channel passing nearby. The works were completed under Phase-I of the scheme whose scope is given below;

Scope of Phase-I of the Project

The works constructed by PHED are described below;

Name of Scheme		Extension/rehabilitation of urban sewerage scheme Kamalia city (Phase-I)		
Administrative Approval Cost		Rs.100.000 million		
Technical Sanction Cost		Rs.98.255 million		
Completion Cost		Rs. 93.776-Million		
Physical progress				
Sr. #	Item of Work	Quantity in PC-I	Completed	Remarks
1	RCC Sewers			
	a) 9" i/d for gully grating	955-Rft	955-Rft	Completed
	b) 12" i/d	560-Rft	560-Rft	
	d) 18" i/d	2,066-Rft	2,066-Rft	
	e) 30" i/d	2,261-Rft	2,261-Rft	
	f) 33" i/d	4,934-Rft	4,934-Rft	
	g) 36" i/d	6,016-Rft	6,016-Rft	
	h) 48" i/d	1,666-Rft	1,666-Rft	
2	Screening Chamber	1-No.	1-No.	
3	Collecting Tank	2-No.	2-No.	Completed
4	Pumping Chamber	1-No.	1-No.	Completed
5	Pumping Machinery	4-Sets	4-Sets	Installed/Functional
6	Sullage Carrier			
	Sullage Carrier 3.5' X 3'	3,940-Rft	3,940-Rft	Completed
	Sullage Carrier 2.5' X 2.33'	1,125-Rft	1,125-Rft	Completed
7	Sump well	1-No.	1-No.	Completed
8	Boundary wall	748-Rft	748-Rft	Constructed
9	Staff quarter	1-No.	1-No.	Completed
10	Inter connection	1-Job	1-Job	Completed
11	Road crossing	2-Job	2-Job	Completed
12	Electric transmission line	1-Job	1-Job	Completed
Scheme has been completed, commissioned and handed over to MC Kamalia on 08-03-2017				

After phase-I of the scheme Phase-II has been launched by PHE Department whose scope is given below;

Scope of Phase-II of the Project

This phase is under construction and the scope of work along with its progress is given below;

1	Name of Scheme	Extension / rehabilitation of urban sewerage scheme Kamalia City (phase-II)
2	Administrative Approved Cost	PKR 488.756 Million

3	Technical Sanction Cost	PKR 488.756 Million			
4	Physical Progress (Provided by PHE Department on 10.07.2019)				
	Sr.#	Item of Work	Scope of work	Completion status	Remarks
	1	RCC Sewers			
		a) 9" i/d	49,972-Rft	23,024-Rft	Work in progress
		b) 12"i/d	11,713-Rft	11,102-Rft	
		c) 15"i/d	4,125-Rft	2,189-Rft	
		d) 18"i/d	3,252-Rft	2,331-Rft	
		e) 21"i/d	2,235-Rft	835-Rft	
		f) 24"i/d	2,515-Rft	1,219-Rft	
		g) 27"i/d	1,250-Rft	1,266-Rft	
	2	A.C Force main			
		A) 28"i/d	11,600-Rft	9,888-Rft	
		B) 24"i/d	7,635-Rft	7,635-Rft	
		C) 20"i/d	850-Rft	829-Rft	
	3	Sullage Carriers		-	
		Size: 2.25' x 3.50'	4,500-Rft	-	
		Size: 3.00' x 4.50'	22,200-Rft	-	
	4	Sump well (size 8'x6')	8-No.	4-No.	
	5	Repair of existing disposal works	1-Job	-	In progress
	6	Diesel generator with generator room	3-No.	90%	
	7	Pumping machinery		-	
		Zone-A (Chungi No. 6)	3-Sets	3-Sets	Completed
		Zone - B (Zeshan Colony)	1-Set	1-Set	In progress
		Zone C (New Disposal works)	2-Sets	2-Sets	Completed
	8	Inter Connection			
		Existing Disposal No.1 & 2	2-Job	1-Job	In progress
	9	Staff quarter	1 No	90%	
	10	Road, canal & railway crossing	2-Jobs	-	
	11	Surface drain type-1	27,286-Rft	9,598-Rft	Work in progress
	12	Street pavement			
	a	P.C.C	136,531-Cft.	33,575-Cft	
	b	Brick pavements	92,587-Cft.	29,622-Cft	
	c	Resoling	91,412-Sft	26,580-Sft	

3.1.6. Pumping / disposal stations

a) Details of pumping stations

Zone No-A & B is being served by pumping stations. The details of each one is given below;

Zone	Location	Nos of collect tanks	Nos of pumps	Discharge each (cusecs)	Total discharge (cusecs)	Motor BHP	working status	Previous sullage Carriers/force main		Present Ultimate disposal
								Size	Condition	
A	Chungi No. 6	3	5	6	30	60	Yes	2.5"x 3.0"	Good	Broad Irrigation
B	Zeshan Colony	2	2	1	2	10	Yes	2.5"x 3.0"	Good	Broad Irrigation
C	Bypass road	2	4	5.0	20.0	75 & 50	Yes	24" dia	Good	Irrigation channel.

3.2. The main issues and problems in the system

With the implementation of sewerage project by PHE Department, most of the problems in the Town have been addressed and especially the problem of ultimate disposal will be addressed after completion of phase-II of the project as the waste water from major areas of the Town will be disposed of in Kamalia Forest where it will be used for irrigation of the forests. The present problems and bottlenecks confronted by the city are given below;

3.2.1. Chocking of sewer lines

Number of sewers have been chocked or semi chocked due to non-cleaning of sewers by MC Kamalia. This is going to create a big hazard for the city in near future.

S.N.	Location	Diameter (Inches)	Solution
1	Stop No. 3 Chichawatni road to disposal work Chungi No. 6	27, 33, 36 & 42	MCs should take up the de-silting of these sewers by winch machines. The last option will be the replacement of these sewers
2	Opposite shell pump to Pakistani Gate	18, 24, & 30	
3	Ghallah Mandi Mor To Telephone Exchange	12	
4	Telephone Exchange To Eid Gah	21	
5	Bhallah Chowk To Railway Station	12	
6	Hasan Chowk To Bhalla Chowk	12	
7	Norani Chowk Via Alfateh Floor Mill	12	
8	Raza Bad To Sabzi Mandi	12	
9	Mekna Wali Chungi	12	
10	Hasan Chowk To Railway Road	12	
11	Eid Gah To Disposal Work Chongi No. 6	36	
12	Hashmat Chowk To Chowk Kohlowala Iqbal Bazar	12	
13	Iqbal Bazar To Noor Shah	12	
14	Telephone Exchange To Railway Road	12 15	
15	Telephone Exchange To Tota Bazar	12	

3.3. Waste water treatment

Waste water from all the disposal works is being used for broad irrigation without treatment. After the completion of Phase-I and Phase-II of the sewerage projects by PHED most of the water from the city will be used for irrigation of Kamalia Forestry located at

south west of Kamalia Town. Waste water treatment plants are required to be constructed to lower down the BOD level as per National Environmental Quality Standards (NEQS).

3.4. Consumer connections

No consumer sewer/drain connection survey in the city has been conducted by this time. Hence the exact number of these connections cannot be estimated at this stage.

3.5. Tariff structure

No user charges have been levied for the liquid waste management. The consumers will have to be charged for this facility as well.

3.6. Operation & maintenance cost vs revenue recovery

The operation & maintenance cost of the sewerage system for the last five years along with the revenue recovery is given below;

O&M Expenditure vs Revenue Recovery (million Rs) (includes manpower, electricity, repairs/replacement & supplies)						
Year	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	Total for 5 years
O&M expenditure	9.015	9.127	9.894	10.432	14.452	52.92
Revenue earned	0	0	0	0	0	0
Percentage recovery vs O&M cost	0	0	0	0	0	-
Subsidy given	9.015	9.127	9.894	10.432	14.452	52.92

3.7. Manpower deployed

The manpower deployed for the operation & maintenance of the system is given below;

Pump operators	1
Baildars	2
Supervisors	0
Sewer men	4

MC is demanding additional manpower because of increase in population as they are serving those areas in the city which are not included within the municipal boundary.

3.8. Service delivery level

- a) The city has main and branch sewers on main roads and streets but few of the streets are not equipped with lateral sewers. These areas are being served with surface drains discharging into the sewers without gully grating chambers which is allowing all the silt and the floating materials in the sewers. This forms the main reason for chocking of sewers and flooding of the roads and streets.
- b) Ongoing PHED project will overcome the issues of city up to major extent and after completion of this project whole city will be equipped with sewerage system. However lateral sewers will still be required for most of the streets.

- c) Waste water treatment is not being done which is major requirement of the city to meet the national standards which requires lowering the BOD of the effluent to 80 mg/l.

Section-4 Solid waste management

4.1 Existing situation

4.1.1 Available resources

a) Equipment & machinery

Under mentioned collection and transportation machinery is available with MC to handle the solid waste.

S.No	Equipment/machinery	Total available Nos	In working condition
1	Tractor trolleys	03	03
2	Arm rolls	0	0
3	4-5 m3 containers	0	0
4	Front blade tractors	01	01
5	Front End loader	01	01
6	Water bowsers	01	01

The existing machinery is neither sufficient nor cost effective and efficient giving rise to low efficiency of collection and disposal of the waste and as a result of that MC is facing increased waste management cost as well as complaints regarding the insanitary conditions in the city. Efficient and cost effective machinery is needed to increase the efficiency of collection and transportation for improving the sanitary conditions in the city and lower down the operational and maintenance costs.

b) Manpower Deployed

The manpower deployed for collection, transportation and disposal of the solid waste is given in the table below. As indicated by MC Officers, this manpower is not sufficient to serve the entire city at the given standards.

Slot	Sanctioned strength	Existing strength	Vacant post	Manpower on daily wages	Total man power deployed	Additional MC demand
Sanitary workers	162	129	33	42	171	100
Vehicle drivers	2	2	0	0	2	7
Supervisors	2	2	0	0	2	5
Sanitary inspectors	1	1	0	0	1	0
Total	167	134	33	42	176	112

Additional manpower required by the MC is also given in the last column. Actual requirement will be identified during detail design and implementation of the project. The city has unsatisfactory solid waste management system due to limited financial and physical resources.

4.2 Reasons for poor service

The city has un-satisfactory solid waste management system. Resources available to handle the solid waste are limited to serve the whole area of city. Limitation in resources is described here.

- a) Shortage of sanitary workers and vehicle drivers.
- b) Shortage and inefficient equipment and machinery.
- c) Non availability of landfill site for dumping of solid waste. Currently waste is being dumped along the road side which is totally unhygienic.
- d) No proper collection points in city are available. However at some places walled dumps exist wherefrom solid waste is collected and transported to the dumping sites.
- e) The waste is being openly dumped without compaction and provision of earth covers which is creating all sort of hazards like; pollution of underground water, vector and vector borne diseases, obnoxious smell and high insanitary conditions.

4.3 Un-served and partially served areas

The entire city is not served with solid waste collection and disposal. The efficiency of the services is 50-55% as given below. Most of the areas of the city remain either un-served or these are partially served. The detail of these areas is given below.

a) Partially served areas

No regular service is rendered in the under mentioned areas. The main complaints are attended by sending the machinery & labor once or twice a week.

1- Basher Colony	2- Ghaziabad	3- Roshan Shah	4- Zameer Colony
5- Jinnah Colony	6- Qadar Town	7- Christian Colony	8- Bilal Ganj
9- Bilal Ganj	10- Gareeb Colony	11- Karkana Bazar	12- Kachi Basti
13- Ghala Mandi	14- Fateh Pur	15- Bakar Colony	16- Canal View
17- Qadar Colony			

b) Unserved areas

Under mentioned areas are still unserved;

1- Private Colony	2- Bagaya Wala	3- Peer Sadiq Shah
4- Adhi Wala	5- Dulma Thatha	6- Khursheed Abad
7- Ali Town	8- Usman Colony	9- Cha Lal Wala
10- Kashmir Colony	11- Nadiabad	12- Ravi Town

4.4 Solid waste Generation & Disposal

The solid waste management efficiency along with present dumping sites are given below;

Total waste generated per day		Total waste collected (Tons)		% Efficiency of disposal	Name of dumping sites	
					SiteNo-1	SiteNo-2
Cubic meters	Tons	Cubic meters	Tons			
84	42*	30-40	21-23	50-55%	54/1 Tukra	-
Distance from city center (Km)					6 KM	-
Open dumping= O Landfill= LF					O	-

*Assumed density of loose solid waste = 500 KGs per cubic meter

4.5 Landfill Site development

Area of 4.00 Acre on Mamu Kanjan road near Chack No 54/1 for proposed landfill site is available. The suitability of the landfill sites will be determined after detailed surveys and design of the project by catering the requirement of the environmental standards in vogue in Punjab.

4.6 Vehicle parking Area:

The detail of the sites available for construction of parking area for the equipment and machinery is given below;

Location	Unit	Area
Zeeshan Colony disposal station	Kanal	2
MC office & water works	Kanal	2

4.7 Levying of sanitation fees

No sanitation fee has been levied by MC and the entire expenditure given below is being met from MC's own resources and the PFC share being given by Provincial government.

4.8 Solid waste management financials

The annual expenditure incurred by MC for last 5 years is given below which includes manpower, energy, repairs, supplies etc.)

Year	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
O&M Expenditure (million Rs)	31.977	34.074	37.623	41.031	57.300

MC will have to levy the sanitation fee to meet the expenditure on solid waste management or at least to lower down the subsidy presently being injected.

4.9 Service delivery

At the average, the service delivery level is not good with 50-55% efficiency. Some portion of the city is either un-served or partially served because of shortage of sanitary staff and machinery & equipment whereas the existing machinery and equipment is inefficient having costly operation and maintenance.

The solid waste is being dumped near Chack No- 54/1 Tukra because no proper landfill site is available which is creating hazards like obnoxious smell, sub soil water pollution and breeding of vectors causing water borne and vector diseases. Apart from that this is also creating insanitary conditions resulting in frustration in the citizen. MC has a piece of land measuring 4.00 acres for the development of Landfill site but it could not be developed due to financial constraints.

Section-5 Roads

5.1 City Roads Hierarchy

The main roads in the city and emerging from the city have under mentioned hierarchy;

S.No	Name of the road	Owner department
1	Toba chichawatni Road	Provincial Highway
2	Kamalia Mamu Kanjan Road	do
3	Kamalia railway Road	do
4	Kamalia Jakar road	District Council
5	Chak No 713 road	do
6	All others roads	Municipal Committee

All these roads have been marked on the map of the city in different colors

5.2 Existing situation

Some of the main and primary roads in MC Kamalia are in good condition. Ten roads required resurfacing and eleven roads required widening and improvement. The detail of the problem roads is given below;

5.3 Required interventions

A. Resurfacing of roads

Under mentioned roads require resurfacing;

Sr. No.	Name of roads	Existing surface	Length (Rft)
R1	Dr. Naeem to Iqbal Bazar	TST	1200
R2	Main Chichawatni Road to MC Office	TST	1250
R3	Mohib Ali Shah	TST	2000
R4	City Top Hotel	TST	1000
R5	Mekananwali Chongi	TST	2000
R6	Telephone Exchange to Tota Bazar	TST	3300
R7	Iqbal Bazar To Main Gate Office MC	TST	675
R8	Markazi Imam Barga,	TST	445
R9	Mohallah Mehtianwala	TST	230
R10	BOP Road	TST	600

B. Widening & improvement of roads

The roads mentioned below require widening and improving after replacement of sewers lines under these roads as describe in section-3;

Sr. #	Name Of Road	ROW	Length	Existing Width	Proposed width
		Ft	Km	Ft	Ft
W1	Stop No. 3 Chichawatni Road To Disposal Work Chungi No. 6	15	3.00	15	15
W2	Opposite Shell Pump To Pakistani Gate	15	1.50	12	15
W3	Telephone Exchange To Eid Gah	33	1.5	18	20
W4	Bhalla Chowk To Railway Station	15	0.75	10	12
W5	Hasan Chowk To Bhalla Chowk	16	0.50	10	12
W6	Norani Chowk Via Alfateh Floor Mill	15	0.60	10	12
W7	Raza Bad To Sabzi Mandi	15	0.85	10	12
W8	Hasan Chowk To Railway Road	15	0.45	10	12
W9	Eid Gah To Disposal Work Chongi No. 6	24	0.85	24	24
W10	Hashmat Chowk To Chowk Kohlowala Iqbal Bazar	18	0.50	10	15
W11	Iqbal Bazar To Noor Shah	18	0.50	10	15

C. PCC Streets

The street mentioned below are equipped with PCC pavements. Undermentioned roads require replacement of PCC in some reaches;

Sr. No.	Name of Mohallahs/ street	Type of Surface	Length
1	Street Sadiq Pehlwan(Late) wali, Street Haji Iqbal (Late), Chowk Norani	PCC	6550-Sft
2	Mohallah Fazil Dewan (Streets Band Cucha Capri Tailor ,Peer Islam, Aqeel Gujjar, Ch. Zahoor, Ramzan Jani wali, Sardar Zargar, Chowk Dr. Mansha)	do	13133 Sft
3	Mohallah Charh (Streets Malik Nadeem, Buttan wali, Qari Hanif, Farooq Cheeni, Kothi Bahadur Chand, Haji Faqir Khadur wali, Ameen Tailor, Kashi Kiryana, Maqbool Patwari, Sh. Haji Altaf(late), Haji Hatim Ali Bhati, Haji Shaffi (late), Master Zulfiqar, Allah Ditta Kiryana)	do	57901Sft
4	Street Rana Dilshad(Alhadi) near Numania School	do	3448-Sft
5	Street Masjid Rubania near Nazar Chowk	do	3406-Sft
6	Street Haji Asif, Master Masood Near Dehli Chowk	do	2374-Sft
7	Street Master Ahmad Ali (Late) Mohallah Nia Bazar	do	1200-Sft
8	Street Dr. Karam Deen wali near Neem wali Masjid.	do	1100-Sft
9	Street Darbar Baba Dargahi Shah wali	do	1914-Sft
10	Street Ch. Arshad Mohallah Hussain Shah	do	2209-Sft
	Total		93235 Sft

Section-6

Parks and open spaces

6.1. Existing situation

6.1.1. Existing Parks

Kamalia City has five main parks as mentioned below;

S.N.	Name of park	Area in acres	Ownership & maintained by
1	Jinnah Park	4.0	Municipal Committee Kamalia
2	Zeeshan Colony park	0.5	do
3	Lady Park	0.75	do
4	Nawaz Sharif Park	12.0	do

6.1.2. Available facilities

Available facilities in parks given below in table

S No	Park No	1	2	3	4
	Name of Park	Jinnah Park	Zeeshan Colony park	Lady park Mohallah Behlol wala	Nawaz Sharif Park
1	Area of Park in acres	4.0	0.5	0.75	12.0
2	Watering & Irrigation				
a	Tube well	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
b	Water Supply from municipal system	No	No	No	No
c	Underground water tank	No	No	No	No
d	Pumping unit	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
e	Distribution pipe lines	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
f	Valves	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
g	Sprinkler system	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
3	Landscaping & Plantation				
a	Grass beds	Average	Average	Average	Average
b	Flower beds	Average	Average	Average	Average
c	Hedges	Average	Average	Average	Average

d	Plants		Average	Average	Average
4	Lights				
a	Poles and masts	Poor	Poor	No	Poor
b	Cables	Yes	Poor	No	Poor
c	Brackets and lights	Poor	Poor	No	Poor
d	Bulbs and tubes	Poor	Poor	No	Poor
e	Control units	Poor	Poor	No	Poor
5	Structures				
a	Buildings	No	No	No	Yes
b	Fountains & water fall structure	No	No	No	No
c	Walkways	No	Yes	No	No
d	Bridges & culverts	No	No	No	No
e	Boundary wall & gate	No	Yes	No	Yes
f	Toilets	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
g	Lakes & brooks	No	No	No	No
6	Mechanical equipmen				
a	Pumping units	Poor	Poor	No	Poor
b	Swings	Poor	Poor	No	No
c	Children games	Poor	Poor	No	No
d	Fixtures	Poor	Poor	No	No
e	Benches	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7	Sanitation & water supply				
a	Litter bins	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
b	Toilet fixtures	Yes	Yes	No	No
c	Sewerage system	Yes	No	No	no
d	Vegetation cuttings & disposal	No	No	No	No
e	Drinking water	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
f	Water pipes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

6.2. Rehabilitation of the existing parks

Some of the facilities in these parks are working in good condition but some of these are in poor condition and need to be rehabilitated. On the other hand some important facilities are missing and need to be provided. The detail of all the required interventions in these parks for their upgrading is given blow;

Sr. No.	Name of Park	Area (Acre)	Boundary wall	Concrete pavers	Water supply	Required allied facilities	
					Item Length /No's	Item	Length /No's
1	Jinnah Park	2	Repair	Jogging track	-	Park lights	15
						Play Land area	1.0 Kanal
						Cafeteria	1
						Wash room	2
						Benches	20
Landscaping	Complete park						
2	Zeeshan Colony Park	0.5	-	-	-	Park lights	5
						Play Land area	0.5 Kanal
						Cafeteria	1
						Wash room	1
						Benches	5
Landscaping	Complete park						
3	Lady park Mohallah Behlol wala	5	Repair	Jogging track	Lawn watering system required	Park lights	30
						Play Land area	2.0 Kanal
						Cafeteria	1
						Wash room	3
						Benches	40
Landscaping	Complete park						
4	Nawaz Sharif park	12	-	Jogging track	-	Park lights	80
						Play Land area	3 Kanal
						Cafeteria	2
						Wash room	8
						Benches	80
Landscaping	Complete park						

6.3. Open spaces to parks

The city has 04 open spaces. Municipal Committee desires to convert the open spaces in to parks to provide recreational facilities to the entire city. Details of open spaces for conversion in to parks are given below:

Conversion of open spaces to parks/Play-ground

Sr. No.	Location of open space	Area of open space (Acres)	Proposed utility
1	Public park	2.00	Park
2	Katchi Basti	1.00	Park
3	Bilal ganj	2.00	Park
4	Paghlawala	1.5	Park
5	Odanwala	1.00	Park

6.4. O&M expenditure

Year	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	Total for 5 years
O&M expenditure	4.710	4.971	5.706	5.749	5.913	27.049

Section-7 Street Light

7.1. Existing situation

Road and ward wise detail of street lights facility in Kamalia city is given below;

A. Detail of street lights on main Roads								
Sr. No	Road	Type of luminaries					Operational Status	Poles type WAPDA pole / street light pole
		Sodium	LED	Tube light	Energy Saver / light bulb	Total		
1	Tehsil Head quarter Hospital to Railway Crossing	-	70	-	16	86	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
2	Mandi More To Ghallah Mandi	-	18	-	-	18	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
3	Railway Road To City Top Hotel	-	30	-	10	40	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
4	Eid Gah Chowk To Bhala Chowk	-	18	-	-	18	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
5	Pakistan Chwok to Shell Pump via Peer Shah Road	-	28	-	5	33	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
6	Railway Road to Hassan Chowk	-	9	-	-	9	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
7	Thana Mor to MC Office Iqbal Bazar	-	15	-	6	21	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
8	Sadar Bazar	-	10	-	5	15	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
9	MC Office to Chichawatni Road	-	10	-	4	14	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
10	Stop No. 3 to Fazil Dewan	-	10	-	5	15	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
11	Sabzi Mandi Road	-	9	-	7	16	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
12	Chichawatni Road To Mekanawala	-	-	-	-	-	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
13	Chechawatni Road to Ghazi Abad	-	10	-	1	11	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
14	Circular Road Zeshan Colony	-	14	-	5	19	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles

15	Eid Gah Chowk To Chongi No.6 Disposal Works	-	16	-	5	21	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
16	Fazil Dewan Park To Cekarno(سڪارنو) Chowk	-	14	-	-	14	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
17	Telephone Exchange To Tota Bazar via Mohallah Behlool Wala, Nia Bazar, Kamalia City.	-	20	-	5	25	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
18	Main Chechawatni Road to Technical College via Mohallah Adhiwal Kamalia City.	-	15	-	-	15	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
19	Center streets Mohallah Bagaiwala.		15	-	-	15	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
20	Hospital Dr. Naeem to Iqbal Bazar Chowk Kohlowala via House Mumtaz Gondal Ex Nazim MC Girls School Mohallah Hussain Shah		10	-	-	10	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
21	Mohallah Paghlanwala, Mohallah Chadhran Wala		15	-	-	15	Partially Operational	WAPDA poles
	Total	0	356	0	74	430	G. Total	

B. Ward wise detail of lights

Ward No.	Name of Mohallah	Light Points
1	Gujjar Colony, Maqbool Colony, Ghallah Mandi Road Mehmood Bhatii Darbar side.	30
2	Main Road Rajana Road Old Bus Stand to Mandi Chowk, Mahallah Fateh Pur, Street Darbar Lakhan Bakhan, Street Shaban Gondni wala to Aslam Naib Qasid wali, street Dr. Abdul Razzaq to street darbar Shaheedan wali to street Jogianwali	37
3	Main Rajan Road to Railway Crossing, Main Rajana Road to Disposal Works Zeshan Colony to street Master Niaz to street Lady Park Zeshan Colony, street Zafar Telephone wali.	80
4	Mohallah Behlol wala to street Altaf Bajli wala.	20
5	Mohallah Kamal Colony, Railway Road.	30
6	Mohallah Odanwala to Mohallah Bilal Gunj	30
7	Railway Station to Karbala to Mandi Mor to Railway Road to Katchi Basti,	30

8	Mohallah Bilal Gunj, Mohallah Raza-e- Mustafa	10
9	Street Darbar Jand Shah to Eid gah Khairan Shaheed to street Muhammad Hussain Press Reporter to street Muhammad Sharif Malik Chairman wali .	20
10	Mohallah Mehtianwala, Tota Bazar , Farooqia Masjid to Barkat Chowk etc.	30
11	Mohallah Islam Pura , Street Shahzad Ullah Councilor, Bhussi Road.	30
12	Mohallah Eid Gah to Mohallah Khaji wala Kho, street Jabar wali.	30
13	Mohallah Paghlanwala, street Zaffar Janua, street Bismillah Masjid.	30
14	Mohallah Madina Abad, street Pir Abrar Butt, Street Fateh Muhammad wali.	20
15	Mohallah Jandi wala, street Numania Masjid, Press Bazar, Street Bhola Advocate and Munir Advocate.	40
16	Mohallah Fazil Dewan, street Ahmad Tent wali, Street Shahanwali, street Neem wali Masjid, street Imam Bargah Fazil Dewan, street Nazakat Pan Shop.	40
17	Mohallah Jand wali Masjid, Mohallah Raj Bibi etc.	30
18	Mohallah Mohib Ali Shah, Mohallah Behlol Park, Madina Masjid, Kareemia Masjid.	30
19	Khalid Colony, Street Qazi Saif Ullah, Street Darbar Iqbal Shah, Street Post Office etc.	30
20	Mohallah Pir Shah, Street Iqbal Sindhu, Street Yousaf Bhatti, Street Madjid Ahle Hadees wali , Street Zargaran wali, Street Khalid Khan Khal etc.	30
21	Mohallah Darbar Roshan Shah	0
22	Main Road Thana Mor to Old Bus Stand, Main Mohallah Road Ghazi Abad, Bashir Colony	40
23	Mohallah Haidry Imam Bargah, Mohallah Kharlanwal, Mohallah Sheikhanwala etc.	25
24	Main Road M.C to Nawaz Chowk, Mohallah Markazi Jamia Masjid, Street Sardar Kamboh wali etc.	20
25	Main Iqbal Bazar , Mohallah Islam Nagar , Street Kohlowali, Ghulam Rasul wali, and street Sh. Sultan wali..	40
26	Mohallah Charh, Hashmat Chowk, street Ali Sial wali, Noori Masjid wali, and street Shaffi Gharey wali.	40
27	Mohallah Dargahi Shah , Mohallah Muslam Sheikhanwala, Street Rai Nadeem wali, Main Road Sadar Bazar Kamali	30
28	Mohallah Madina Abad, Fazil Dewan, Street Rafique Gujjar wali, Bilal Masjid wali, Allah wali Masjid , Rana Chowk, Sikarno Chowk, Mohallah Madina Abad Road.	30
29	Street Qurishian walai, Chowk Jan Muhammad wala	20
30	New Sabzi Mandi Road, Street Anwar Plumber wali, Qadria Masjid wali, Malik Mansha wali old Sabzmandi wala road. Main Road to Jhone Shah Road Kamalia.	30
31	Mohallah Noor Shah Road.	10
32	Mohallah Bagahiwala to main Bazar Bagahiwala THQ main road to Stop No.3	20

33	Mohallah Adhiwal to Chichawatni Road , Chak No. 711-GB, Street Zawar Saroya wali	25
34	Chichawatni Road near Stop No. 3 to Darbar Mian Mohabat Khan Road, Main road Stop No. 3 to Thana Chowk etc.	35
Total lights		992

7.2. Repair and replacement:

MC Kamalia requires repair and replacement of street light on the under mentioned main roads of the city;

Sr. No.	Name of Roads	Qty. (No's)
R1	Chichawatni Road THQ to Railway Crossing	97
R2	Main Rajana road Mandi Mor to Railway Station	30
R3	Hospital Dr. Naeem to Iqbal Bazar	40
R4	Stop No.3 Fazil Dewan,	20
R5	Mohallah Behlol Wala, to Nia Bazar	30
R6	Office MC to Markazi Imam Bargah,	50
R7	City top Hotel to Railway Station	50
R8	Mohallah Ghazi Abad	14
R9	Eid Gah to Christian Colony, Katchi Basti	50
R10	Bhussi Road	30
R11	Zeshan Colony	30
R12	Sadar Bazar, Iqbal Bazar	28
R13	Mohallah Baghaiwala	10
R14	Mohallah Sheikhanwala	21
R15	Mohallah Charh	05

7.3. Provision of new street lights

MC Kamalia desires to provide new street light on the under mentioned main roads of the city;

Sr. #	Name of road/street	Length (Km)
N1	Pakistan chowk To Shell pump via peer shah road	2.0
N2	Railway road To Hassan chowk	0.5
N3	MC office To chichawatni Road	0.5
N4	Sabzi mandi road	1.5
N5	Chichawatni road To maikan wala	1.0

N6	Chichawatni road To gaziabad road	1.5
N7	Fazal dewan park To Scarno chowk	1.0
N8	Main Chechawatni Road to Technical College via Mohallah Adhiwal Kamalia City.	2.0
	Total requirement (Length)	10

7.4. Expenditure on street lights

Under mentioned expenditure on the Operation & Maintenance of the existing street lights has been incurred by MC Kamalia during the last 5 years. This includes the energy cost, manpower cost and cost of repairs and replacements.

(All figures in million Rs)

Year	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
O&M Expenditures	2.747	3.047	3.178	4.521	5.864

Section-8

Public Private Partnership projects & Collaborative Projects executed by MC

8.1. Planning & Execution of PPP projects

As informed by Chief Officer, no project in the Public Private Partnership Mode & Collaborative Mode has ever been executed by the Municipal Committee or defunct TMA Kamalia. As such the key officers and staff have no experience as well as capacity for planning estimation and execution of such projects.

Section-9

Budgetary provisions on development of services infrastructure and O&M Cost

9.1. Development expenditure

The expenditure incurred on the development projects from year 2013-14 to the current financial year & source of financing is given below

(All figures in million Rs)

Description	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
Expenditure on Development Projects	34.467	47.727	44.086	26.885	60.00
Source of Financing of Development Projects	Own source revenue				
	ADP grants				
	PFC share				

9.2. Expenditure on O&M of services and revenue generated

Description	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
<u>Water supply</u>					
Total O&M cost	27.94	30.24	28.93	30.13	46.05
Revenue earned	4.25	7.20	7.87	7.95	10.00
% revenue earned vs O&M charges	15.09	23.82	27.20	26.38	21.72
Subsidy injected	23.69	23.03	21.06	22.18	36.05
<u>Sewerage/drainage</u>					
Total O&M cost	9.015	9.127	9.894	10.432	14.452
Revenue earned	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil
% revenue earned vs O&M charges	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil
Subsidy injected	9.015	9.127	9.894	10.432	14.452
<u>Solid waste management</u>					
O&M cost	31.977	34.074	37.623	41.031	57.300
Revenue earned	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil
Subsidy injected	31.977	34.074	37.623	41.031	57.300
<u>Parks</u>					
O&M cost	4.710	4.971	5.706	5.749	5.913
Revenue earned	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil
Subsidy injected	4.710	4.971	5.706	5.749	5.913
<u>Street Light</u>					
Total Expenditure	2.747	3.047	3.178	4.521	5.864
Revenue earned	The service is not charged.				

Section-10 Manpower deployment & shortage

The manpower deployed by MC Kamalia in various Municipal Services is given below. MC is experiencing manpower shortage in some of the services which is also explained herein.

S.No	Description	Sanctioned Regular strength	Actual Regular deployment	Regular Vacant Slots	Employed on daily basis	Shortage of regular personnel	Additional requirement
A	Office manpower						
1	Key officers (BPS-17 & above)	05	03	02	-	02	-
2	Sub engineers	03	03	-	-	-	01
3	Support staff (BPS-16 & below)	83	73	10	-	10	10
	Total office manpower (A)	91	79	12	-	12	11
B	Municipal services						
1	Water supply	21	04	17	11	17	48
2	Sewerage	05	05	-	02	-	10
3	Solid waste management	329	263	66	84	66	212
4	Parks & Roads	26	22	04	-	04	-
6	Street lights	02	02	-	-	-	04
7	Slaughter houses	-	-	-	-	-	04
	Total municipal services (B)	383	296	87	97	87	278
	Grand Total (A+B)	474	375	99	97	99	289

Section-11

Public opinion surveys regarding the municipal service delivery

S. No.	Name of Service	Total persons interviewed	Opinion of the persons interviewed				Average consumer opinion
			Poor (Nos)	Fair (Nos)	Good (Nos)	Excellent (Nos)	
1	Water supply quantity	13	0	08	03	02	Good
2	Water supply quality	13	01	09	03	0	Fair
3	Sewerage	13	04	09	0	0	Fair
4	Street sweeping	13	07	06	0	0	Poor
5	Solid waste collection & disposal	13	07	06	0	0	Poor
6	Condition Parks & play grounds	13	0	13	0	0	Fair
7	Slaughter house functioning	13	04	09	0	0	Fair
8	Street light functioning	13	11	09	0	0	Poor
9	General condition of roads	13	0	06	07	0	Good
10	Complaint attending capability	13	04	09	0	0	Fair

Survey of Public general view over service delivery

S.No	Name of person interviewed	Muhallah or colony	Water supply		Sewerage	Street sweeping	Solid waste collection & disposal	Roads	Parks & play grounds	Slaughter houses	Street light	Complaint addressal
			Quantity	Quality								
1	Asad islam	Mohalla Muslim Sheikhan	Excellent	Good	Fair	Fair	Fair	Good	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair
2	Sheikh arslan	Mohalla Muslim Sheikhan	Excellent	Fair	Fair	Poor	Poor	Good	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair
3	Rana ihsan	Mohalla Maisai Wala	Good	Fair	Poor	Fair	Fair	Good	Fair	Poor	Poor	Poor
4	Ch. Farooq	Mohalla Daglan Wala	Good	Good	Fair	Poor	Fair	Good	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair
5	Samson	Mohalla Noor Shah	Good	Good	Poor	Poor	Poor	Good	Fair	Poor	Fair	Poor
6	Abdulla	Mohalla Hussain Shah	Fair	Fair	Fair	Poor	Poor	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair
7	Ch. Adnan	Khalid Colony	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair	Poor	Good	Fair	Poor	Poor	Poor
8	Qasim	Khalid Colony	Fair	Fair	Poor	Poor	Poor	Fair	Fair	Poor	Poor	Poor
9	Zahid bashir	Mohalla Bahlal Wala	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Good	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair
10	Umair aslam	Mohalla Bahlal Wala	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair
11	Kalsoom	Kamal Colony	Fair	Poor	Fair	Poor	Poor	Fair	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair
12	hiba ashraf	Kamal Colony	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair
13	Husnain shah	Kamal Colony	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Fair	Poor	Fair