

**Evaluation Report**  
**(As Per Clause 5.93 Section V. Procurement Provisions of Procurement Regulations)**

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	Punjab Municipal Development Fund Company (PMDFC)																																				
2	Method of Procurement:	<b>Selection Based on the Least Cost Based Selection (LCS)-World Bank Regulations</b>																																				
3	Title of Procurement:	Hiring of Consultants for Resident Construction Supervision for Rehabilitation/(M&R) Projects under Punjab Cities Program (PCP) (3-Packages)																																				
4	Tender Inquiry No.:	PK-PMDFC-160078-CS-LCS																																				
5	Date & Time for Proposal Closing:	20 <sup>th</sup> April, 2020 at 1200 hours																																				
6	Date & Time for Proposal Opening:	20 <sup>th</sup> April, 2020 at 12:30 hours																																				
7	Name of Firm submitted Proposals	<table><tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Consultant's Name</th></tr><tr><td colspan="2"><b>Package-1</b></td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>M/s Asian Consulting Engineers</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant &amp; Master Consulting Engineers</td></tr><tr><td>4</td><td>M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants &amp; HA Consulting</td></tr><tr><td>5</td><td>M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.</td></tr><tr><td colspan="2"><b>Package-2</b></td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>M/s Asian Consulting Engineers</td></tr><tr><td colspan="2"><b>Package-3</b></td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>M/s Asian Consulting Engineers</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant &amp; Master Consulting Engineers</td></tr><tr><td>4</td><td>M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants &amp; HA Consulting</td></tr><tr><td>5</td><td>M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.</td></tr><tr><td>6</td><td>M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd</td></tr><tr><td>7</td><td>M/s ECSP (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with ECC Global (Pvt.) Ltd &amp; TEAM Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd</td></tr></table>	Sr. No.	Consultant's Name	<b>Package-1</b>		1	M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd	2	M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	3	M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers	4	M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants & HA Consulting	5	M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.	<b>Package-2</b>		1	M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd	2	M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	<b>Package-3</b>		1	M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd	2	M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	3	M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers	4	M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants & HA Consulting	5	M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.	6	M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd	7	M/s ECSP (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with ECC Global (Pvt.) Ltd & TEAM Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd
Sr. No.	Consultant's Name																																					
<b>Package-1</b>																																						
1	M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd																																					
2	M/s Asian Consulting Engineers																																					
3	M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers																																					
4	M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants & HA Consulting																																					
5	M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.																																					
<b>Package-2</b>																																						
1	M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd																																					
2	M/s Asian Consulting Engineers																																					
<b>Package-3</b>																																						
1	M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd																																					
2	M/s Asian Consulting Engineers																																					
3	M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers																																					
4	M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants & HA Consulting																																					
5	M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.																																					
6	M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd																																					
7	M/s ECSP (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with ECC Global (Pvt.) Ltd & TEAM Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd																																					
8	No of EOI Received and Evaluated:	Ten (10)																																				

222

S.No	Name of Participating Firms	Marks Obtained Out of 100
1	M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd	98
2	M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd	94
3	M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	92
4	M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers	81
5	M/s MASCON Associates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants & HA Consulting	81
6	M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.	79
7	M/s ECSP (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with ECC Global (Pvt.) Ltd & TEAM Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd	68
8	M/s Eminence One (SMC-pvt.) Ltd	58
9	M/s East End Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd.	55
10	M/s NAA Consulting Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd	54

9

Criteria for evaluation of Technical Proposal:

Sr.#	Criteria/Sub-Criterions	Maximum
(i)	Specific experience of the Consultant in last 10-years (as a firm) relevant to the Assignment (01-Point per assignment)	10
(ii)	Adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference:	30
a	Technical approach + Methodology	15
b	Work Plan	10
c	Team composition, organization & staffing	5
(iii)	Key Experts' Qualifications and Competence for the Assignment	60
a	Chief Resident Engineer/Team Leader (1-No)	10
b	Senior Engineer (1-No)	10
c	Assistant Resident Engineers (6-Nos for Package-1 & 5-Nos each for Package-2&3)	30
d	Site Inspectors (6-Nos for Package-1 & 5-Nos each for Package-2&3)	10
	Total	100

M/s En  
M/s N  
JV v  
Co  
P

#### 10. Detail of Proposal Evaluation

Name of Bidder	Technical	Read Out Price in PAK Rs. (Without GST)	Evaluated Cost in PAK Rs. (Without GST)	Ranking
<b>Package-1</b>				
M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	90.81	25,989,583/-	25,218,363/-	4 <sup>th</sup>
M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd	89.95	27,396,445/-	26,973,630/-	5 <sup>th</sup>
M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers	87.04	15,668,000/-	15,668,000/-	2 <sup>nd</sup>



M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.	86.86	15,070,000/-	15,570,000/-	1 <sup>st</sup>
M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants & HA Consulting	86.20	20,628,200/-	16,334,655/-	3 <sup>rd</sup>
<b>Package-2</b>				
M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd	92.68	23,778,573/-	23,355,758/-	2 <sup>nd</sup>
M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	88.98	22,510,166/-	21,738,946/-	1 <sup>st</sup>
<b>Package-3</b>				
M/s JERS Consultancy (Pvt.) Ltd	92.70	23,778,573/-	23,355,758/-	7 <sup>th</sup>
M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd	92.58	22,206,550/-	22,132,800/-	6 <sup>th</sup>
M/s ECSP (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with ECC Global (Pvt.) Ltd & TEAM Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd	92.54	18,510,000/-	18,040,000/-	4 <sup>th</sup>
M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	91.08	22,510,166/-	21,738,946/-	5 <sup>th</sup>
M/s MASCONAssociates (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Zaheeruddin Consultants & HA Consulting	86.86	18,789,000/-	14,818,103/-	3 <sup>rd</sup>
M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers	84.42	13,930,000/-	13,930,000/-	1 <sup>st</sup>
M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.	81.69	13,650,000/-	14,150,000/-	2 <sup>nd</sup>

#### 11. Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder:

The Name of Successful the Consultant	Total Contract Price in PKR Rs. (Without GST)	Duration of the Assignment	Summary-Scope of Services
Package-1			<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Window-1 of the Program comprises of 90% of the Program cost amounting to 180 million USD whereas 20% of the cost of subprojects funded under this window, will be co-financed by the Program MCs. Under this package, the municipal services existing infrastructure including water supply, sewerage, solid waste management, roads, street lights, fire-fighting and parks will be rehabilitated for developing their economic growth potential.</li><li>For improvement of the existing municipal infrastructure for better service delivery, Rehabilitation projects will be taken up in Year-1 (2019-2020) of the Program. However the projects covering the provision of municipal services in the unserved areas of the Program cities will be taken up from Year 2 to Year 5 of the Program.</li></ol>
M/s Enviroconsult (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd.	15,570,000/-	Eight Months from the date of Signing of the Contract	
Package-2			
M/s Asian Consulting Engineers	21,738,946/-	Eight Months from the date of Signing of the Contract	
Package-3			
M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with Indus Associated Consultant & Master Consulting Engineers	13,930,000/-	Eight Months from the date of Signing of the Contract	

224

			<p>3. For Year-1, to accomplish the job, PMDFC intends to hire consulting firms for resident supervision of Rehabilitation projects.</p> <p>4. The objectives of the Consultancy Services are to bring the municipal infrastructure at a level of satisfactory service delivery in the presently served areas.</p> <p>The resident supervision for 16-Cities have been divided into 3 regionally based packages. However, there is no binding over a consultant to participate in more than 1 package. Region wise Package with MCs names are given as below:</p> <p><b><u>Package-1:</u></b> Daska, Hafizabad, Jhelum, Kamoke, Muridke, Wazirabad (Northern Punjab)</p> <p><b><u>Package-2:</u></b> Gojra, Jaranwala, Jhang, Kamalia, Okara (Central Punjab)</p> <p><b><u>Package-3:</u></b> Bahawalnagar, Burewala, Khanewal, Vehari, KotAddu (Southern Punjab)</p>
--	--	--	---



**(RIZWAN KHALID)**  
Sr. Program Officer (Procurement)